Beyond Good Intentions: Race Regimes, Racialisation, Immigrant Service Non-governmental Organizations (IS-NGOs) and Race-Class Reproductions in Canada

Wanda Johnson Chell[1] & Dip Kapoor[2,*]

[1]Language Instruction for New Canadians (LINC), NorQuest College, Canada

[2]Professor, Department of Educational Policy Studies, University of Alberta, Canada

*Corresponding author: Department of Educational Policy Studies, University of Alberta, Alberta, Canada. Tel: 1-780-492-7617. E-mail: dkapoor@ualberta.ca

Abstract

Based on research conducted in a Parenting and Literacy Program (PLP) offered by an Immigrant Service-Non Governmental Organisation (IS-NGO) located in Alberta, Canada, a racialisation and race regimes framework is deployed to advance the proposition that IS-NGOs and their approach to programs and service provision encourage race-class inequalities and augment the contemporary race regime of multiculturalism in Canada. This is in/advertently achieved by selectively racializing im/migrants and reproducing class inequities through the adherence to neoliberal prescriptions (best practices) while claiming to settle, support and work for social justice for im/migrants. We explore the structures, ideas and power relations of an IS-NGO as a race regime and its' race-class implications for perpetuating hierarchy's which continue to define a Canadian colonial settler society. The purpose of this research is to stimulate renewal within IS-NGOs, as an exercise in critical reflexivity and to encourage changes at the organisational and employee/practitioner level, by fostering efforts to undermine, redirect and replace race regimes and class inequality in the interests of a still emergent democratic society and polity in Canada.

Keywords: Race; Racialization; Race Regimes; Immigrant Service Non-Governmental Organizations; Social Reproduction; Race-Class Inequality; Political-Sociology of Multiculturalism; Canada.

1. Introduction

As a settler nation the official narrative is, "Canadian society today stems largely from the English-speaking and French-speaking Christian civilizations that were brought here from Europe by settlers" (Citizen and Immigration Canada [CIC], 2013) with colonialism explained simply as a bi-product of human migration (Sharma, 2011). Since inception, Canadian immigration policy has intentionally had a Eurocentric bias that maintains racialised immigration based on ethnicity, nationality, race and social class. The point system introduced in 1967, saw the level of formal education, one's profession, age and ability to speak English/French become the primary determinants in granting residency visas to Canada; a process in which, "[b]oth the federal and provincial governments play significant roles in terms of immigrants' entry, settlement and integration" (Zamen, 2006). The shift to a criteria based im/migrant policy did not end but rather redirected preferential im/migration. Im/migrants are distinguished and categorized by nation-states, tribunals and business on the basis of such subjective and fluid criteria such as the marketability of skills, professional standing, age, financial holdings, state of origin and/or current or historical geo political connections. Status is assigned, access denied, or permanency promised with labels such as: labour, skilled, professional, irregular, temporary, undocumented, and illegal, retiree, refugee, or asylum seeker, environmental, trafficked, forced or returning.

"Canada's immigration policy has been guided by three broad objectives: to reunite families; to fulfil the country's international obligations and humanitarian tradition with respect to refugees; and to foster a strong, viable economy in all regions of Canada" (Statistics Canada, 2005). However in the current climate of neoliberal fiscal responsibility, "[o]ur Government's number one priority remains jobs, economic growth and long-term prosperity" (Kenny, 2012). It is the economy, shaped by thirty years of neoliberalism that dominates public discourse and im/migration policy in Canada. Neoliberal policies, ideology and governance focused on market efficiency, competitiveness, deregulation, and the commodification of "the commons" influences who is recruited for im/migration to Canada; who is pushed towards im/migration; the status ascribed to im/migrants; and obligations or connections maintained with the 'home' country.

As government programs have been reduced or eliminated under neoliberal austerity policies and the increasing corporatisation of the state and as the profit margins in social service provision are generally unattractive to private investors, the contracting out and privatisation of social services has witnessed a concomitant growth of charities, non-profits and NGOs who are now expected to compete for the public (state) and private (market and civil society) dollar. The number of charitable organisations established in the past thirty years, as well as the size and scope of the services offered by these organisations, including those marketing services to im/migrants, has become a vital industry on behalf of the state (Holder, 1999).

In keeping with Vickers and Isaac's (2012) use of race regimes analysis, we put forward the proposition that IS-NGOs augment the contemporary race regime of multiculturalism in Canada and Alberta more specifically, by continuing to racialise im/migrants to Alberta in the name of settlement services and multicultural commitments. We critically explore the

structures, ideas and power relations of an IS-NGO and its implications for reproducing the selective racialisation of im/migrant experiences which reinforce "…the physical and psychological borders against racialized bodies..." (Walia, 2013, p.40). This process of racialisation occurs in conjunction with the continued neoliberalisation of state services now being off-loaded on to IS-NGOs who are also being subjected to and appear to be embracing neoliberal managerial imperatives and interventions (e.g. best practices or market-based funding approaches). Subsequently IS-NGOs have become complicit in the reproduction of race-class hierarchies in the name of helping and serving im/migrants. This critical exploration includes but is not limited to an examination of IS-NGO strategies and daily practices pertaining to: funding, fundraising and organisational branding; being accountable; labour recruitment; and im/migrant 'client' identity constructions and inscriptions of negative difference. These processes incorporate and rely on racist practices that reproduce a political system which perpetuates the hierarchical nature of Canadian colonial settler society, despite the good intentions policy rhetoric of helping organisations.

The issues, questions and insights raised here are intended to encourage critical discussion and self-reflection at the organisational and employee/practitioner level to illuminate, problematise and address on-going racialisation of im/migrants and neoliberalisation of IS-NGOs through the uncritical adoption of practices which only serve to perpetuate race-class hierarchies. The attempt here is to support the organisation in achieving its' stated vision of acting"...as a key catalyst and leading collaborator in positively shaping the attitudes, behaviours and practices of organizations and individuals and to value the diversity that newcomers bring to the community"("EMCN Vision", 2018) while speaking to other IS-NGOs in the province and country, where such analyses and observations may well prove to be pertinent.

2. Research Methodology and Conceptual and Analytical Schemes: Race Regimes and Racialisation in Humanitarian IS-NGOs

This research was recently conducted within a Parenting and Literacy program (PLP) offered by the Edmonton Mennonite Centre for Newcomers (EMCN) for which the principle researcher was a long term, paid facilitator.[1] Fourteen in/voluntary im/migrant women participated in the research. All participants were mothers, between 20-45 years of age, with children ranging in age from six months to adulthood. Women learned about the program from multicultural health brokers, settlement workers, word of mouth and EMCN advertisements. The participants self-identified as originating from Asian, African and Latin American Countries. All had limited levels of proficiency in English with many experiencing interruptions in formal primary schooling. For several participants, circumscribed legal status in Canada meant access to health care, social services and educational opportunities were restricted.

Participatory research (Chovanec& Gonzalez 2009; Fine, 2007; Kapoor, 2009; Kemmis & McTaggart, 2008; Maguire, 1987) and pedagogy (Fals-Borda, 1991; Fine, 2013; Freire, 1983; Hall, 1977; Horton & Freire, 1990; Shor, 1992) guided and addressed the primary research

purpose which focused on collective reflection to address a critical analysis of EMCN as a potential and contemporary "multicultural race regime", interpolated with the "founding race regimes" of "internal colonialism" and "slavery" (Vickers & Isaac, 2012). Writing included the generation of co-constructed texts, journal entries, personal narrative writing, all during learning circles which utilised dialogical focus groups; a method simultaneously used to analyse data (Hannan & Kicenko, 2002). Field notes were written during and/or immediately after class. EMCN materials and those provided by outside organisations/funders were critically analysed in relation to a race-regimes and racialisation framework, in conjunction with a semi-structured interview with a senior administrator.

Vickers and Isaac's conceptualization of "Race Regimes" and associated racialisation highlights the structures, discourse, and power relations that contribute to race-based discrimination and provides a critical bi-focality informing such analyses, i.e., maintaining the ability to focus on the structures and histories being spoken of, as well as the particular lives and realities of the participants in an organization such as EMCN (Fine, 2013). It serves to temper an us (researchers/participants) versus them (IS-NGO/funders) dichotomy from forming when engaged in critical conversations directed towards organisational renewal, by directing attention upstream to the structures and practices of the state guiding EMCN and those who work for/within the organisation.

A regime includes the embedded cultural and social norms which often remain unquestioned and endure in institutions and practices that come to regulate the operation of an institutional form and its interaction with society and its sub-sections. Vickers and Isaac put forward the proposition that Canada, as a white colonial settler nation has consciously and with intent "…created and contained race regimes- that is legal and political institutions and practices based on racialism" (Vickers & Isaac, 2012 p.5). As a political system, a race regime is composed of three distinct parts, i) structures: the institutions through which those in power manage race regimes ii) discourse/ideas: the ideology, laws and regulations that establish categories according to race schema and iii) power relations: between the citizens and the denizens, the elite and the ruled (Vickers & Isaac, 2012). The distinct components of a race regime, like the cogs of a bicycle, work simultaneously to rationalise and perpetuate the unspoken, two-tiered system of entitlements and responsibilities experienced in Canada which are naturalised and celebrated under the guise of official multiculturalism.

Race regimes are also characterised by processes of racialisation or "…the social, political, economic and historical processes that utilize essentialist and monolithical racial markings to construct diverse communities of colour…" (Walia, 2013 p. 61). Mignolo argues "…racialization is always a classification and a ranking, and that classification is not embedded in 'nature' but is man-made" (Gaztambide-Fernandez, 2014 p.201). Racialisation includes the systemically designed processes that construct diversity in order to maintain settler privilege. IS-NGOs are needed to maintain, buffer, and render invisible what Schmitt (1996), relying on Frantz Fanon, refers to as the pretence of grand objectification achieved through racist practices including: infantilisation, denigration, distrust, ridicule, exclusion, rendering invisible, scapegoating and violence. All these racist practices, "…serve the same purpose of objectification' denying genuine human relations, falsifying and making people

what they are not" (Schmitt, 1996 p. 40).

Additionally, critical colonial and feminist scholarship pertaining to humanitarian NGOs (Bannerji, 2000; Razack, 2007; Thobani, 2007) and critical scholarship in international development exploring issues of race and NGOisation (Choudry & Kapoor, 2013; Barry-Shaw & Oja Jay, 2012; Wilson, 2012) also partially informed this exploratory research on IS-NGOs as organisations perpetuating race regimes in Canada, in particular, the contemporary race regime of multiculturalism. EMCN, as an example of an IS-NGO is interrogated deploying NGO discourses which highlight processes and occurrences of "…institutionalization, professionalization, depoliticilization and demobilization..." (Choudry & Kapoor, 2013 p.1) within organisations committed to social change and raises questions as to whether or not immigrant services represents a specific form of regulation and containment. Mahrouse (2010) suggests that well-meaning social justice efforts are, "…rich sites for exploring racialized privilege and whiteness, because they reveal the extent to which white hegemony and the liberal paradigm changes that which might otherwise shift existing power relations" (p.169). Scholarship on the non-profit, "White Saviour Industrial Complex" (Cole, 2012; Kivel, 2007; Smith, 2007) furthers this critical-analytical optic and exploration in to the interplay between charitable giving, the state, funders and IS-NGOs.

3. Neoliberalism and Race-Class Reproductions by IS-NGOs as Multicultural Race Regimes

The Alberta government has deemed that im/migrants need specialised and segregated social services. On the Alberta Learning Information Services websites, documents direct immigrants to special immigrant-serving agencies for employment and learning supports rather than accessing regular employment services.[2] In an EMCN video (2014) management share the IS-NGO is successful in delivering social programs, "…because many of our staff are immigrant's themselves". Culturally knowledgeable and linguistically skilled staff appear outside the domain of 'mainstream' social service delivery. EMCN staff functions as native informants, cultural interpreters or expert professional immigrants. The IS-NGOs act as a race regime by providing segregated services in the delivery of social services, based on place of birth and ethnicity-read as race. The im/migrant, in stepping through the doors of the IS-NGO, is being filtered from mainstream social service models while being "targeted" at the point of arrival in the province.

The Edmonton Mennonite Centre for Newcomers, a key provider of such services, relies heavily on the dedicated commitment of volunteers and donors to help ensure that, "…programs and services can continue to support newcomers to Edmonton' (EMCN, 2015) and actively seeks funds from the private sector in the form of corporate/private donations. The work of EMCN is sold to potential donors as filling the gaps in the system. The state uses the taxation system as a means of directing private funding towards IS-NGOs. Writing from within an American context, Ahn (2007) notes, donations offered by foundations, are partly made with dollars which, were it not for charitable deductions allowed by tax laws, would have become public funds to be allocated through the government process under the

controlling power of the electorate as a whole. The state divorces itself from responsibility while controlling the mechanisms for distribution and places the power for allocating funding for social services into the hands of a few. Taxation and charitable giving is a practice within the regime to benefit the upper and consumer classes in at least two ways: first, by minimizing the rate of taxes paid and second by allowing these classes to direct social supports in ways that are most beneficial for the preservation and reproduction of unequal social relations wherein the coloured immigrant is initiated as a 'needy recipient' thereby reinforcing the power relations of a neoliberal multicultural race regime.

Best practices promoted by the neoliberal government and voluntary sector (Charity Central, 2011; "Charity Village", 2018; Institute on Governance, 2008) help to construct and augment the multicultural race regime and associated class reproductions of inequality through, for instance, the INGO's approach to: a) fundraising and promotions; b) accountability; c) employment brokering for their 'clients'; and d) staffing of the IS-NGO. The corresponding implications for the client often manifests as a form of e) 'ventriloquism of the denizen' trapped in and subsequently un/wittingly reproducing continued race-class inequality being perpetuated by an IS-NGO as part of the wider institutional architecture of a multicultural race regime.

3.1 Corporate and Private Fundraising and the Spectacle of Race-cultural Promotions

One approach used by EMCN to finance programming is through funding appeals to larger funding agencies spawned by the neoliberal state as part of the broader design pertaining to the privatisation of state services. EMCN annually supports the fundraising campaign of a larger North American organisation which subsequently reinvests in their programs and services. EMCN devotes time and resources, and aggressively pursues donations from staff and clients to support the larger organisation, while at the same time devoting internal resources to writing funding proposals, attending organisational meetings and completing accountability reports to the same organisation. The associated administrative processes keep a team of middle management professionals securely employed and strategically well positioned between EMCN and the funding organisation(s) as gatekeepers in the buffer zone. Kival (2007) observes that professionals employed in the buffer zone serve to: i) insure just enough service is offered to avoid chaos, ii) maintain the system by controlling those who want to be empowered/saved and iii) keep hope alive by distributing opportunities to the exceptional and the worthy.

Reviewing the 2013 campaign brochure titled "Create Pathways out of Poverty" for the organisation partnered with EMCN, poverty-images were all associated with people of colour who were also mainly children. Such phenotypic raced characteristics of the preferred face of clients reproduce a race-class typing with poverty, destitution, and social 'failure' and a category of social marginalisation and ideological production of the coloured im/migrant constantly in need of help and white tutelage to facilitate assimilation on terms defined by anglo-benefactors. Predictably, the campaign video by contrast, has largely white professionals speaking as experts and witnesses of the realities and consequences of poverty and associated remedies. The campaign chair writes, "[e]veryday I see disheartened people

on our streets, homeless and struggling to survive...[now] imagine what our communities would be like if everyone currently living in poverty was instead able to contribute their talents and energy to *our* economy" (Personal correspondence). While the experts may view themselves as allies of under-waged populations, using there white privilege for a greater good, this campaign reinforces white saviour narratives and is ultimately focused on solving the homeless problem for the good of the 'economy' (and the upper and consumer classes who profit from a strong economy where goods and service flow upwards). It exploits the experiences of im/migrants seeking services for the purpose of private finances, marketing and securing employment for mainly white middle class professionals and subsequently reinforces us/them race-class binaries.

The following event is one example of EMCN using participants in the PLP for the purpose of corporate fundraising and related marketing and promotion activities:

> *A large corporation wants to make a substantial donation to the PLP and publically present a cheque to EMCN. The women in the program are told to share circle time with the donors. This is usually finished by 1:00 but is extended to 1:30 to accommodate the donor's schedules. Regular routines were completed and participants then wait, entertaining toddlers and babies in a crowded room until the donors arrive at 1:50. The assistant to the Executive Director (ED) comes into the room and tells us to start. Mothers, children and staff began to sing, accompanied by a large African drum. A multilingual book is read. Representatives of the corporation are ushered into the room, positioned behind the families. An oversized cheque is held up by the corporation's representatives and handed to the ED and the Program Manager. Photos are snapped and most of the entourage walk out of the room. One man, white and middle age, shakes my hand before leaving and congratulates me on the good work we do for immigrants. The next day pictures of cute babies from "othered race-cultural" backgrounds were posted on the corporation's website*

(Field notes, Participant observation, 2013)

Figure 1. EPCOR, "Providing support to families new to Canada", Retrieved from: http://corp.epcor.com/News/2012/Pages/nov-16-mennonite-society.aspx (16 November 2012)

While not privy to the original funding proposal this event was explained to the women, and staged for the public to indicate funds donated would be of direct benefit to the children and parents of the PLP. In reality, the funds went into the general operating budget of EMCN, as 'rent' payment. The feel-good quality of supporting families generated from images of cute children of colour was exploited. First, by EMCN to acquire additional funding for general operations and, second from a corporation wishing to create a positive public image with a multicultural marketing strategy reminiscent of a 'United Colours of Benetton' advertising campaign.   Drawing from further abroad Wilson (2012) notes,

> One has only to enter the offices of any of the major international NGOs or development bodies to find oneself in a space where mainly white staff work surrounded by glossy, larger-than-life photographs of smiling non-white children (and more recently, adolescent girls) and be forcibly reminded of the racialised boundaries and relations of power between providers of development and their 'beneficiaries', 'users' and 'partners. (p.221)

The im/migrant families in the PLP, became the poster child, literally, for cultural difference and diversity. The families who performed and women who donated their instructional time were neither asked if they wished to perform in this theatre nor did they receive applause for their performance, yet I, as an instructor, was praised for my good intentions and deeds, affirming my moral self through exceptional labour and my position of power in relation to the women.

What was striking as a participant during this event was the lack of contact between the donors and so-called recipients. The representatives did not engage in conversation, join the circle or even seem to spend time observing the room. For the corporate foundation the event seemed like an opportunity to garner a charitable tax receipt and a positive press release. The women and children they were 'helping' remained largely *invisible* while the use of women and children for the most part *infantilized* im/migrants; all potential forms of *objectification* which Schmitt qualifies as racism.

The *performance* and pageantry, indicative of state sponsored multiculturalism, is central in the branding and marketing of EMCN. The IS-NGO capitalises on its multicultural brand when fundraising.

> I mean just to give you an example…we had a fundraiser fashion show, we did it by continent, this was Africa and the idea, the Africans put on a stage, there was a stage area and music and a fashion show… (SD Interview, February 2013)

Diverse geopolitics, language, histories and cultures are reduced and diluted (packaged) to fabricate the homogeneous caricature of the African. The performance of the exotic foreigner other serves as entertainment, consumed by potential donors in the same manner as the 'ethnic appetizers' of samosas and steamed buns. It is but a marketing strategy to 'put a face' to recipients so that giving/donors can see the African women they are helping, akin to strategies used in 'voluntourism' and child sponsorship programs (Mahrouse, 2010; Wilson,

2012). The feel-good display of diversity maintains the myth of an accepting Canada, while serving to conceal the demeaning paternalism of an associated multicultural race regime at work in social helping/service relations.

Emails are distributed encouraging staff and clients to wear traditional clothes for special events and choir members wear ethnic /national dress for public performances. An administrator, sharing the experience of participating in an EMCN award ceremony writes, "…[t]he fashion show (part one) took the stage next and featured fashions from India…These colourful outfits were modelled by employees and volunteers…" (Internal organizational newsletter, 2012). Photos taken at these events are later used in newsletters and public relations materials directed towards funders and the general public. In one newsletter, the executive director, is depicted wearing a Ghanaian shirt. While the idea may have been to honour the histories, traditions, and cultures of the im/migrant communities that make up the organisation, the practice is an ostensibly racist one as it acts as appropriation for the purpose of costume dress up and promotion (if not amusement for those prejudiced consumers of such imagery), reminiscent of black face performances of an earlier era (Comaroff & Comaroff, 2009).

The examples cited are considered good practice within the non-profit industry and represent a form of exploitation of non-white bodies by EMCN to garner the funds necessary to subsidize the delivery of specialised social services to im/migrants on behalf of the provincial and federal governments; fundraising practices which potentially encourage such race-class reproductions in the pursuit of funds in a privatized state social service environment where non-profits compete for the im/migrant service dollar.

3.2 Being Accountable: The Construction of Disadvantage and Referrals

Schmitt (1996) writes "…well-meaning members of dominant groups assume that any subject group member that needs help is 'disadvantaged" (p.36). According to a PLP funding proposal:

> Waitlists for the program keep growing…Many parents wish to keep returning
> to the program to both deepen and broaden their knowledge of parenting and
> to advance their English proficiency. However, we have so many isolated and
> desperately need[y] parents for whom *we fill an obligation* that we have had to
> limit the registration of eager learners in attempting to balance the opportunity
> for all (Silito, 2012, p.2, emphasis added)

Other documents refer to im/migrants seeking services as desperate, limited, exasperated, at-risk, high-needs, vulnerable, and/or experiencing multiple barriers. The language suggests a state of emergency, families in crises and im/migrants 'at-risk' of tragedy and/or connotations of criminal desperation with associated costs for the recipient society. EMCN may not be the originator of these terms, drawing upon the language of dominant discourses of the IS-NGO multicultural race regime, or aligning words/catchphrases with those of grant criteria. However the decision to engage in this language (ideological construction) has a concrete effect.

> If you want to get a kid into Head Start they need to be vulnerable, high-risk (laughter). They need to be all those things, right…The at-risk, we really had to deal with that…for youth, youth at-risk. I hate it (SD Interview, February 2013)

The newcomer is constructed as in need of protection and care. The administrator interviewed acknowledges and is clearly uncomfortable with the racist practices of *infantilisation* and *denigration* of im/migrants experience, yet its use is rationalised as the means of acquiring resources either for the agency or the client and crises language rationalises interventions that are exempt from standard checks and balances.

Funding models not only influence how EMCN gets money but the structure and implementation of programs. The PLP, as directed by funding, is mandated to increase the social supports available to clients and "…giving women a safe space to learn English as a stepping stone into other programs… (SD Interview, February 2013). PLP success is measured based, in part, on the quantity as well as breadth of successful 'support' referrals. Detailed statistics are kept regarding the number of families receiving leisure access passes, library cards, food bank referrals, developmental assessments and/or early education. One December, every participant was given a Christmas bureau form to complete regardless of financial need or holiday tradition. This may have been done to de-stigmatise a request for holiday assistance or it may have been a technique to booster the clients served. What is significant is the power relationship involved in this 'helping' exchange and how the exchange positions the im/migrant.

Consider how referrals to services are determined.

> M: But I will say, I do think we make assumptions around like (long pause) a child like (male Japanese child's name) probably wouldn't be referred to head start but a child like (female Afghan child's name) would be and my sense is that it is linked to family complexity and giving her space to develop on her own and develop her own, I don't know, I don't know but I, we do, it is slightly economic and economic level driven I believe it is.

> W: and do you think it is kind of (pause) umm (pause) culturally or racially driven as well?

> M: Yah, I mean the economically driven part is that I had money to put my children into preschool…(SD Interview, February 2013)

This section highlights a lack of universally applied criteria for referrals, though economics may come into play and family complexities are alluded to. It appears essentialist and monolithic constructs are projected on the young Afghan girl and her family. As white professionals, the suggestion seems that this child is "the quintessential victim[ ] of patriarchal ideologies associated specifically with [her] cultural and religious heritage" (Jiwani, 2010, p. 63) or to borrow from Spivak (1988) that we as white women need to save her, a brown girl, from brown men. The same politics of the veil used to rationalise intervention in Afghanistan are being employed. The Japanese boy is safe from institutional

interventions as Asians are the model im/migrants. The fluid and subjective criteria used to determine im/migration status is being replicated within the IS-NGO. Drawing on Vickers and Isaac (2012), the IS-NGO represents two components of a race regime. It becomes a site for managing race regimes through the construction of the im/migrant. The IS-NGO also re/enforces power relations through staff /im/migrant hierarchies through the controlling of access as well as between clients through referrals.

Alternatively, an underlying belief within the program's design is that parent(s) with interrupted formal schooling are poorly equipped to provide quality early childhood care or that quality care requires specialised/professional training, predominately performed by other women. Early education programs, according to ABC HeadStart, are recommended to families who, in the absence of a national childcare program, require assistance and are intended to provide a stimulating environment for pre-school children as a bridge linking families to future educational resources with families being placed under the guidance of social workers whose role sets the tone for the family involvement (ABC HeadStart, 2013).

Attention within the PLP is given to the use and retention of home/first languages, yet the PLP paradoxically makes referrals for early interventions for 'deficient' non-English speaking children who demonstrate language or social delays. For women with limited formal schooling these programs devalue/deskill their position as caregivers and keepers of knowledge, as their children are removed from the home to receive a 'leg up' so they won't be 'left-behind'. In the process of stepping into other programs women/children/families are crossing bridges and subjected to white settler culture. Referring children and mothers into intervention programs serves the race regime in several ways. Early education and parenting support become: sites of indoctrination into neoliberal (market) ideology (including necessary labour market socializations in to unequal class stratifications to encourage compliance with same) and race-class inferiorisation; they quietly erode the influence of home language and culture (promotes cultural inferiorisation and deficit thinking); stream children based on linguistic and socio economic criteria and segregate and contain the other, 'protecting' middle-class communities from so called at-risk, vulnerable families.

3.3 Integrating in to Inequality: IS-NGO Employment Brokering and the Production of Race-class Hierarchies Through Ranking

A neoliberal focus on reducing the role of the state and the privatisation of services, demands im/migrants become economically self-sufficient, with participation in the under/paid labour market acting as a marker of integration. Integration is central to EMCNs work and is accomplished through 'building capacity' and 'the bridging' of im/migrant populations to facilitate potential insertion in to capitalist social relations; a process that is conceptualised and laden with race-colonial judgements about the im/migrant, not unsimilar to, if not as a continuation or reproduction of related constructions in NGO-led international development work (e.g. micro-credit interventions) in a North-South trajectory (Elyachar, 2006).

> …we tried to get an I-WIN [Immigrant Women Integration Network] going in
> the North with the Sudanese people and it didn't go anywhere … the south
> east Asian women came and they were depressed and isolated and feeling

> horrible … within three or four weeks they were, they were, umm getting energy back already, energy that they had from their past. Whereas the Sudanese women never had the right kind of energy, for here … they didn't know how to get social capacity going (SD Interview, February 2013).

Such (mis)conceptions of the women's pre-im/migration experience are used to rationalise the success of programming from one community to another. A hierarchy of newcomers is (re)created based on judgements regarding whose culture (race) has capital (socio-economic energy). Rodriguez (2010) suggests that the reason for this is, "[n]ational difference is necessary to the racialised [and gendered] work hierarchies on which the global division of labour, and hence capitalism's profits, depends" (p.). The statement "…the Sudanese women never had the right kind of energy, for here…" suggests past participation in the paid labour market, skills learned in formal, institutional schooling and/or urbanity are judged as being 'right' (or not) for Canada and is evidence of the classification and ranking that racialises im/migrants.

Here the IS-NGO is also effectively deflecting responsibility for program failure from the organisation on to clients, as clients 'never had' the capacity to succeed, utilising the prevailing neoliberal emphasis on individual responsibility/blame to desired effect for the institution. The programs and services offered by IS-NGOs are intended to efficiently and effectively support a self-directed (who are, as discussed, simultaneously constructed as "helpless" and "lacking" when it serves other institutional objectives) im/migrant but in the process reproduces race-class hierarchies by sorting and channelling im/migrants in to programming and (potential) jobs and employment streams that offer little in skill development or accreditation but maintain precarious economic status based on neo-colonial race criteria. For instance, the South East Asian women are often ranked higher by EMCN than, for example, the Sudanese women, confirming Vickers and Isaac's (2012) argument that Asians have become "…the 'poster children' for immigration and refugee groups' perceived as self-reliant, hardworking and committed to educational attainment, or to use the director's words 'having the right kind of energy for here" (p.248).

In reviewing the EMCN 2013 Community Report a striking characteristic of each client's successful integration story is the centrality of gainful employment. EMCN recognises these economic successes are not without issue.

> …in an ideal world we would, we would be getting people jobs that were complete, were truly living wages and we don't do that and we only wish we could, like that is our goal. And I think the reason we exist is because it is easy to get a McDonalds job, it's a little harder to get the others so with our brokering we can do that but that is the first step -- to get income into the system… (SD Interview, February 2013).

It is recognised that Alberta's minimum wage is not a living wage (this has just been raised by the current New Democratic Party government after four decades plus of Conservative party governance in Alberta), and the 'entry' level jobs open to im/migrants are insufficient.

Money is circulating in the system, stimulating the economy and contributing to the tax base but without similar benefit to the worker, positioning im/migrants in the economic margins of society, maintaining unequal class-race power relations with the initial assistance of a segregated EMCN employment brokering service. Despite these shortcomings, the organisational response to the issue of underemployment is to hire more professional employment brokers to help im/migrants.

Canada's immigration system is highly selective, with the majority of im/migrants to Alberta possessing the education and skills required to work as skilled labour or in the professions. That im/migrants may still need the brokering services offered by IS-NGOs in order to potentially secure a below living wage job which undervalues their skills and abilities, continues to speak to race-based denigration experienced by many im/migrants entering the country. The competency and qualifications of im/migrants are often called into question by professional associations and certification boards that determine the (de)accreditation and/or (de)skills that can be marketed (Alberta Labour, 2014). Working as brokers, EMCN contributes to the process of sifting and culling through potential employees, endorsing those deemed exceptionally competent. The imbalance of power, between the broker (e.g. EMCN) who can open doors and the im/migrant seeking access is striking. The process racialises the broker and the client.

In the 2013 Community Report, "Bayani, is a success because he started by *knowing nothing* about business, and the entrepreneurship program *gave him the knowledge* and planning to start an operational business…" (EMCN, 2013, p.26). Bayan's educational and professional credentials and life experiences prior to im/migration, are ignored as a contributor, when assessing his success as a restaurateur. EMCN 'gave knowledge.' In valorising its' professional and expert contribution in the marketing of IS-NGO program and services to potential new clients, funders and community supporters, the organisation silences and undermines the abilities and experiences and subsequent contribution of already capable participants by virtue of pre-immigrant education and work experience. The process of marketing the IS-NGO denigrates clients and reinforces relationships of domination/subordination that benefit the neoliberal state and its' corporate partners.

Employment brokers are also a market response by EMCN to serve a niche clientele. The IS-NGO contributes to and profits from the continued under-valuing and denigration of im/migrant skills and credentials through the offering of bridge programs and certification preparation classes targeting foreign-trained professionals. The IS-NGO sympathises and quietly laments the power of accreditation boards, yet in offering bridging programs grants legitimacy and serves to support exclusionary practices. Accreditation programs have also become an area of income generation for EMCN, operating on a cost recovery/profit model. The racialised hierarchy of nationality is acted out in the arena of education and played out in the field of employment.

Former Prime Minster Harper stated, "We have been quite systematically re-orienting our immigration over the last several years to make it more focused on economic needs and focused on more long-term labour market needs" (Mas, 2015). Mirroring or responding to

this official construction, EMCN serves as a filter to screen, select and prepare migrant labour, often actively utilizing un/spoken race-nationality stereotypical criteria, for business and industry. Finding employment has become an indicator of programming success, regardless of the type of program/service and job-skills mis/matches. This should be of concern for an organisation committed to social justice for if an im/migrant's primary, if not only, value lies in the labour they can contribute (exchange value), then in the name of social justice, they have become complicit (with the neoliberal state and the market) in ensuring the opposite.

3.4 Staffing and Recruitment for the INGO: The Role of "good intentions" in a Competitive Service Industry Volunteer Market

Competing as out-sourced social service providers EMCN must minimize staffing costs. In pursuing this objective, the organization attempts to recruit and retain a committed underpaid labour force by extracting non-waged labour from waged employees while also maximizing participation of non-waged volunteers. EMCN actively encourages volunteerism from within the im/migrant communities being served by the organization, dangling the promise of Canadian experience and connections (networking) to motivate engagement in non-waged labour and to create a bank of loyal, potential new employees. Does the client feel pressured or obliged to volunteer in return for continued access to services? Is the IS-NGO profiting from the under-valuing and deskilling of im/migrant volunteers? Do im/migrant clients receive the expected levels of trained, quality and consistent services from such volunteers?

IS-NGOs are curiously successful in their ability to recruit and retain non or under-waged labour. For those working within the IS-NGO, 'building bridges' or the process of constructing relationships and networking, is sold as a transformative experience which influences the character and world view of the employee or volunteer. This is illustrated in the EMCN (2013) annual Community Report, "[l]ike so many EMCN volunteers, she goes beyond the ordinary by breaking down barriers, making meaningful connections and helping people feel at home.." (p.26). Here we see the language of good intentions and a not so subtle call to do more and give more to the organisation. In the same report a volunteer shared, "I do not have my family here, but I discovered there is a lot of fun in helping others. I can communicate with different people and learn about the unique cultures of their countries"(p.27). EMCN becomes a surrogate family and unpaid labour (volunteerism) is the connection. The im/migrants are framed (in relation to EMCN recruitment drives) as unique, exotic outsiders in need of help and portrayed as a source of personal self-improvement (for the employee/volunteer) as we learn about 'their countries'. In an incestuous ritual of sorts, the im/migrant client is almost always actively "positioned as outsider" (e.g. as exotic) by the IS-NGO, as this ensures the status of being excluded from and therefore in need of mainstream supports/services provided by the IS-NGO, thereby precluding the possibility of making the organization and its' services redundant.

Staff are placed at the centre of the experience and the im/migrant other is (re)constructed to this end. This serves at least two identifiable purposes. First, it normalises the (staff) position as the centre in relation to others, subsequently maintaining the employee's place of domination and privilege. This marketing strategy is evident in an EMCN video in which

white directors, counsellors, teachers and employers assist a professional from Burundi, fluent in one of Canada's two official languages, to access housing and write a Canadian resume (YEG Newcomers, 2013). Wearing a suit and filmed in an office setting, the video highlights the client as a success, marking his *exceptionality*, a practice that objectifies by virtue of stressing exceptional status for this Burundian vis-à-vis otherwise mostly average/unexceptional Burundians or Africans. The efforts of EMCN staff are credited (centred) and the potential effect is one that *infantilises* the client as no space is given to consider his contributions to same nor is there any attempt to allude to the structural or root causes (e.g. neoliberal austerity measures) of the housing problems faced by im/migrants to the province. As race regimes go, here the im/migrant is supported by the IS-NGO, while simultaneously ensuring "appropriate insertion" (as befits an exceptional African im/migrant) in to prevailing race-class hierarchies.

It is also essential for IS-NGOs dependent on the exploitation of a caring and compassionate labour force to provide the carrot of transformation as compensation for voluntary and/or mandated volunteerism. Razack (2007) argues, that in bearing witness and building bridges, service providers may become "…engaged in a peculiar process of consumption… rely[ing] on these images and stories to confirm our own humanitarian character" (p. 376). Heron (2007) notes,

[b]oth as individuals and as national subjects, white-middle class Canadians and other Northerners continue to construct through the prism of a planetary consciousness a sense of self in moral terms that expresses the entitlement and obligation bourgeois subjects feel to 'help' Others (p.34)

Figure 2. 131200 Sky Club6
Retrieved from: http://emcn.ab.ca/volunteer/

The affirmation of development work (along the North-South colonial relationship) is rescripted within the IS-NGO as a site of collection and containment where the other can be met without the inconvenience of travel vaccines or flights. Like the missionary and colonist before, the work we do 'changes lives'. Working for a caring, helping organisation "…we inadvertently paint ourselves larger-than life…' (Heron, 2007.p. 43) when we assume we can solve the problems of at-risk, barriered and desperate families. The identity we are able to construct through our engagement in such labour is, however, predicated on the continual *denigration* and *infantilisation* of the im/migrant clients we claim to be empowering.

3.5 Circumscribing and inscribing outsider status and guestness in clients: Producing inferiority?

> It feels like you need to be white to be Canadian…if you are Muslim it feels like you will never be Canadian because your culture and religion are different. All of your holidays are different and so is your language. It feels hard to be Canadian when you don't have roots and your family lives far away. If the policies are good, we are good and we feel like we are Canadian. We will feel more Canadian when we get paid more…Our children feel Canadian and they are here. We wonder when we will be Canadian too? (Participant co-constructed text, 2012)

From "Third Worldist" denigration to race-culture/religious im/migrant denigration, racism as objectification continues within the IS-NGO-led contemporary multicultural race regime in Canada through such circumscribed difference often regurgitated by objectified im/migrant participants straining to seek (as illustrated by the above quote) entry as when participants repeat neoliberal and charitable dogma like, "[s]ponsors are responsible for everything, not government because so many immigrants, too many people for government" (Participant statement).

That said, the women participating in the PLP recognize that to be Canadian is to be white, regardless of the official rhetoric of multiculturalism and diversity. The prominence of white teachers and administrators within the IS-NGO constantly affirm this as do curricular materials continually promoting middle class, Eurocentric parenting norms. Despite this "contextual and programmatic whiteness", the women participants conspicuously articulate their outsider status arising from embodied forms of racialisation such as hairstyle and the wearing of a head-scarf. The participants recognise the use of visible race-markers of negative difference being reinvented in a post-racist, colour-blind, multicultural Canada. As shared, these participants are conscious of how the images taken of them and their children are used in the marketing and branding of EMCN. [3]

An IS-NGO focus on hospitality and the welcoming of strangers affirms the idea of being outside of Canadian society. In the statement, "[i]t feels hard to be Canadian when you don't have roots…" the women express a sense of this guestness in Canada too and their exclusion from regular life. Clients are also required in assuming the persona of the newcomer if they wish to access social supports, for once a client presents as 'settled' (=independent) they can no longer receive agency support. Shifting im/migration legislation also contributes to this

sense of qualified-welcome. The women also suggest that being different means "…the possibility of genuine human encounters is remote except within the limits of ones' own [language and religious] community" (Schmitt, 1996, p. 47)

In, "[o]ur children feel Canadian and they are here", the women are assuming that their children, by virtue of a Canadian education and fluency in English, possess the cultural capital necessary to integrate, to become whitened and invisible in middles class society suggesting that despite personal experiences of guestness the women appear to have internalised or have come to mimic, the ideology of top-down multiculturalism and the development discourse of personal empowerment via a Western education. "We wonder when we will be Canadian too?" suggests a perception of some magic point when, through the process of self-improvement-via language training and skill training- that social citizenship is granted. And in our conversations together the women often apologise for their English/level of literacy, engaging in a form of self-denigration (a potential reflex of neoliberal state-IS-NGO inscriptions) regarding their learning progress, challenges and disruptions.

The participants in the PLP class do recognise the connections between macro and micro level policies- that decisions made at the national level directly impact inclusion or exclusion to micro level services. The policies referred to are related to the tiers of access in Canada's hierarchical im/migration system. Sharing experiences and challenges arising from legal status or labels- a government versus private sponsored refugee, a temporary foreign worker vs a permanent resident, a refugee claimant vs an irregular immigrant- the women recognise that many of the barriers faced are the result of regulations the state created by establishing categories based on state of origin and/or current or historical geo political connections schema. The IS-NGO, as the out-sourced contracted provider of settlement services becomes accountable for carrying out and enforcing these arbitrary divisions to access, thereby functioning as a part of a multicultural settlement service race regime.

Similarly, the participants also speak of the economic separation they experience employed as under waged labour. The denigration of skills and credentials, the limiting or denying of legal employment, a regulated minimum wage (as opposed to living wage) and the absence of a national childcare strategy position im/migrant women as denizen labour in Canadian society. The IS-NGO programs and supports intended to get immediate 'money into the system' direct im/migrants to under waged labour while the IS-NGO benefits from the re/accreditation and re/skilling process.

4. Discussion: 'Sometimes I need help but I want to do it myself'

IS-NGO norms, industry practice, funding models and state policies, contribute to the on-going racialisation of im/migrants seeking settlement support. Neoliberal ideals such as self-sufficiency within im/migration policy expect "[n]on-insured populations … to live within the limits of their own powers of self-reliance (Hall, 2010.p. 74). Underpinning programming and cloaked in the liberalist rhetoric of bridging, empowering, capacity

building and agency, is a deficit thinking that 'blames' im/migrants seeking support for not having the normative cultural skills and knowledge necessary to contribute to the region's economic success. When IS-NGO clients say, 'sometimes I need help' deficiency models are employed to direct participants to community social services to access resources that may be urgently needed or to provide services that may/not be of primary interest. The mantra of resource scarcity drives measures of accountability and contributes to a culture of in which stringent criteria for receiving supports/services are justified often using recursive stereotypes about the racialised "other's" laziness" (Winant, 2014). Furthermore, accessing supports positions the client under greater surveillance by service agencies and/or community workers and subject to the terms, conditions and sanctions of those services. IS-NGOs seem to have adopted (state-sanctioned or not) a moral imperative to instruct, correct and mold the im/migrant client under the guise of settlement and integration. Ordinary practices become occasions for intervention and psycho-social change. The ensuing environment is one in which the im/migrant parent is infantilised through the "support imperative", denigrated in relation to parental capabilities, distrusted in motive/need and feels ridiculed as a consequence of ascribed linguistic or cultural incompetence. The interplay back and forth between intervention and integration creates a perpetual motion wherein the im/migrant is constantly constructed as "failing" by some dominant account. Accessing "supports" offered by IS-NGOs subsequently often becomes an exercise in racialisation and racism for the deficient im/migrant. This is not to suggest im/migrants would be better off without support but rather that the act of 'help', as a neo/colonial and neoliberal construction in IS-NGO-im/migrant relations, has material and deleterious consequences in terms of exploitative race-class reproductions.

EMCN's staff, many of whom were once youthful third world volunteers spreading western imperialist values, are now under-waged labour within an organisation that serves as a site for collecting third world im/migrants, both as clients and labour. Staff often recognise the consequences of work and must negotiate the unease arising from incongruences between intent and outcome. An efficacious and profitable strategy adopted by those working within IS-NGOs is, what Heron (2007) refers to as, the identity of the 'good white', which not only secures donations and a self-sacrificing staff but helps to manage the discomfort experienced in unequal relations. For example, the core principles and emphasis on a 'holistic' approach to settlement can be read as an avowal of alternative/better practice that sets the organisation/ employee morally apart and beyond refutation. In making the argument, if we don't provide service to im/migrants then who will, the organisation is claiming a moral imperative to work for the greater good. The paternal benevolence which ensues, ignores the agency of the "clients". When EMCN argues that it may not be perfect but is better than the alternative, it is claiming exceptionality. In addition, it suggests clients should be internally grateful for the generosity of the Canadian state and therefore without the right to complain or protest. In the practice of 'act first, apologise second' staff are asserting their unique status and IS-NGO work takes on missionary overtones not un-similar to that found in humanitarian 'Third World' development projects.

The programs and services offered by IS-NGOs seek to develop the self- sufficient im/migrant but in the process reproduce race-class hierarchies by sorting and funneling im/migrants into programming based on neocolonial criteria and into employment streams that offer little in skill development or accreditation but maintain precarious economic status. In the process IS-NGOs profit from serving a niche market bridging labour and industry and employees profit from the professionalisation of IS-NGO provision and the status gained from engagement in good work that continues to validate privilege. The professionalisation of EMCN's diverse Third World staff acts to whiten those employed in middle class labour. The process of racialisation for im/migrants becomes tied with labour, economic status and association with middle class humanitarianism. Equally the sorting process justifies the im/migrants role in under-waged employment. This is important in defining social ranking in a Canada where the official and common-sense rhetoric simultaneously promotes multiculturalism, classlessness and egalitarianism. Additionally, the sorting and sifting of im/migrants, both, provides a classed-labour force to service the wants and needs of the middle/upper classes while doing so in a manner that is potentially absolved from class-guilt (given the official and common-sense rhetoric of Canada as an egalitarian, welcoming multicultural polity) as this is being accomplished in the name of the moral act of settlement services for needy im/migrants.

The humanitarian development model employed by IS-NGOs coupled with the economic and socio-cultural filtering functions leaves an impression on the im/migrant "client". For example, the self-denigration demonstrated by participant researchers, often read as modesty by client and staff alike, becomes an act of self-racialisation. The racist practice of denigration, as identified by Schmitt, if internalised, may act as a form of self-mutilation in relation to self-esteem. Clients who say 'sometimes I need help but I want to do it myself' can be disempowered by the processes of 'help', counter to the stated IS-NGO helping rhetoric as has been suggested. The research indicates that the participants in the PLP offered by EMCN seem to assume many of the projections being foisted on them by the institution. Yet when given an opportunity the participants identify and speak to the laws and regulations, institutions and structures that support the contemporary race regime of multiculturalism in Canada. Patterns in program participation rates for instance, suggest that women assert agency by using the program in an instrumental way to address particular needs. Stories generated during learning circles highlighted 'I haven't always been this way', identifying the life events leading to the economic positioning that labels a family as barriered or at-risk and spoke to the agency and resilience within the family and communities concerned suggesting that clients are not naïve victims of racist and classist social structures (e.g. race regimes) devoid of agency or recourse. Im/migrants accessing IS-NGOs can and do, in some ways, shape these institutions as well, influencing ideology, laws and regulations and may acquire social/economic status on their own terms, albeit slowly and often quietly despite IS-NGO circumscriptions and inscriptions of deficiency and im/migrant public transcripts seemingly affirming race-cultural and economic inferiority.

5. Concluding Reflections: Disrupting Claims of Innocence

The purpose of this participatory research was to highlight issues, raise questions and critique the neoliberal market logics and racialised practices which often shape and are adopted by IS-NGOs. It is intended to support and encourage self-reflection and renewal within EMCN, an organisation founded on the good intentions of a helping imperative. Recent work within EMCN evaluating how programs and policies align with the organisations core principles of social justice, diversity, compassion, and responsibility suggests there is a sense, at some level, of the incongruences between intent and practice. Adjustments have been made to programs and processes within EMCN to better align with the stated principles. However, just as with "clients", deficiency tends to be the explanation for these incongruences. Social justice will supposedly be achieved from the correct quantities or doses of additives of more money, resources, programming, training, or education. In taking such an approach the IS-NGO remains focused on supporting existing structures rather than focusing on imagining what it could or should be.

The avoidance or so-called absence of race (color-blind rhetoric) within EMCN and the structures supporting it does not mark its irrelevance but rather its centrality in the settlement process. The conversation regarding referring children to services highlights the possibility that when the issue of race is broached, it is ignored or deflected. The researcher's discomfort in questioning a supervisor (during the research) about race was palpable. Clients discussing experiences with racist practices are placated with 'it is the act of one bad person'. Diversity and integration, multiculturalism and intercultural training, are the bread and butter of the organisation. An admission of tension might suggest institutional ineffectiveness in terms of the dominant managing discourse. Race talk challenges naïve understandings of meritocracy, the Canadian mythology of moral goodness and our own sense of altruism. Yet these are the conversations needed if the façade of innocence is to cracked. Clients need to be heard and employees/volunteers at all levels need to speak what they know/feel but are uncomfortable discussing.

EMCN has shifted from a local response to the 'boat people' to becoming an institution. Embedded in the local landscape, it has become both a site and a tool for managing race regimes and re/enforcing class stratification. EMCNs exist because of pre-existing state race regimes but these race regimes rely on EMCN to perpetuate, reinforce, mask, make invisible and buffer the pretenses of grand objectification. Race regimes are in perpetual motion, responding and adapting. IS-NGOs, as learned through this research, are an extension of the contemporary race regime of multiculturalism in Canada. The constant morphing and shifting of the structures, ideas and relationships that compose a race regime are part of settlement organisations who claim exceptionality on this front by virtue of their helping status. IS-NGOs, working for social justice, would be wise to engage in on-going critical reflection. Teju Cole (2012), writing about the White Saviour Industrial Complex, notes that while humanitarians see needs they "… see no need to reason out the need for the need". IS-NGOs rationalise or justify organisational work with the desire to help but making a difference does not outweigh all other considerations. IS-NGOs must be willing to engage in uncomfortable

conversations with clients and employees that deeply challenge the good intentions that are at the core of their organisational identity.

References

ABC HeadStart. (2013). *Our Program*. Retrieved from http://www.abcheadstart. org/our Programs

Ahn, C.E. (2007). Democratizing American philanthropy. In Incite! Women of Colour Against Violence (Eds.), *The revolution will not be funded: Beyond the non-profit industrial complex* (63-76). Cambridge: South End Press

Alberta Labour (2014). *Working in Alberta: A guide for internationally trained and educated immigrants*. (Catalogue Item 761881). Government of Alberta, Labour. Retrieved from https://alis.alberta.ca/pdf/cshop/WorkinginAlberta.pdf

Bannerji, H. (2000). *The dark side of the nation: Essays on multiculturalism, nationalism and gender.* Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press.

Barry-Shaw, N., & Oja Jay, D. (2012). *Paved with good intentions: Canada's development NGOs from idealism to imperialism.* Halifax: Fernwood Publishing.

Charity Central. (2011). *Road to accountability handbook.* Edmonton, Alberta: Margaret Sadler.

Charity Village. (2018). Knowledge Centre. Retrieved from https://charityvillage.com/cms/knowledge-centre

Chovanec, D. M., & Gonzalez, H. M. (2009). A participatory research approach to exploring social movement learning in the Chilean Women's Movement. In D. Kapoor &S. Jordan (Eds.). *Education, participatory action research, and social change: International perspectives* (223-228). New York: Palgrave Macmillian. https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230100640_16

Citizen and Immigration Canada [CIC], (2013). Canadian multiculturalism: An inclusive citizenship. Retrieved from http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/multiculturalism/citizenship.asp

Choudry, A., & Kapoor, D. (2013). *NGO-ization: Complicity, contradictions and prospects.* London: Zed Publications.

Comaroff & J. Comaroff J.L. Comaroff & J. Comaroff. (2009). *Ethnicity, INC.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Cole, T. (2012, March 21). The white-saviour industrial complex. *The Atlantic.* Retrieved from http://www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2012/03/the-white-savior-industrial-complex/254843/

EMCN. (2018). *Vision.* Retrieved from http://emcn.ab.ca/corporate/vision.html

Edmonton Mennonite Centre for Newcomers (2015, June 4). Retrieved from: https://www.facebook.com/pages/Edmonton-Mennonite-Centre-for-Newcomers/392311 284144109?fref=nf

Edmonton Mennonite Centre for Newcomers. (2014, April 2). *A long lost video about EMCN* [Video File]. Retrieved from: https://www.youtube.com/ watch? v=DQDZ8pnQeaI

EMCN (2013). Annual Community Report 2012-2013. Retrieved from: http://emcn.ab.ca/community-report-2012-2013/

Elyachar, J. (2006). *Markets of dispossession: NGOs, economic development, and the state in Cairo.* Durham: Duke University Press.

Fals-Borda, O. (1991). Remaking knowledge. In O., Fals-Borda & M.A.Rahman (Eds.), *Action and Knowledge: Breaking the Monopoly with Participatory Action-Research* (pp.146- 164). New York: The Apex Press.

Fine, M. [Society for Community Research and Action]. (2013, July 26). On participatory policy research in times of swelling inequality gaps [Video file]. Retrieved from: http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5EKXvb_Tf7g

Fine, M., & Torre, M.E. (2007). 27 theorizing audience, products and provocation. In P. Reason & H. Bradbury (Eds.). *The SAGE handbook of action research: Participative inquiry and practice* (2nd ed., pp.407- 419). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications

Freire, P. (1983). *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. New York: The Continuum Publishing Corporation.

Gaztambide-Fernandez, R. (2014). Deconial options and artistic/aestheSic entanglements: An interview with Walter Mignolo. *Decolonization: Indigeneity, Education and Society*, *3*(1), 196-212.

Hall, A. (2010). Genocide and global capitalism. In *Earth from property: Colonization, decolonization and capitalism* (pp.684-711). Montreal: McGill-Queen's Native and Northern Series, McGill University Press.

Hannan, M., & Kicenko, J. (2002). Facilitator's guide to run a learning circle. *Adult Learning Australia*. Australia: Panther Publishing and Printing.

Heron, B. (2007). *Desire for development: whiteness, gender, and the helping imperative.* Waterloo, Ontario: Wilfred Laurier University Press.

Holder, B.S. (1999). *The role of immigrant serving organizations in the Canadian welfare state: A case study.* CERIS. Metropolis. Retrieved from: http://ceris.metropolis.net/Virtual%20Library/community/holder1/holder1biblio.htm

Horton, M., & Freire, P. (1990). *We make the road by walking: Conversations on education and social change.* In B. Bell, J, Gaventa and J. Peters, (Eds.), Philadelphia: Temple

University Press.

Institute on Governance. (2008). *Literature review of nonprofit best practices in governance and management*. Ottawa, Ontario: Graham, J., & Kinmond, M

Jiwani, Y. (2010). Doubling discourses and the veiled Other: Mediation's of race and gender in Canadian media. In S. Razack, M.Smith, and S. Thobani (Eds.), *States of race: Critical race feminism for the 21st century* (pp. 59-86). Toronto: Between the Lines Press.

Kapoor, D. (2009). Participatory academic research(par) and people's participatory action research (PAR): Research, politicization, and subaltern social movements in India. In D. Kapoor & S. Jordan (Eds). *Education, participatory action research, and social change: International perspectives* (pp.29-44). New York: Palgrave Macmillian. https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230100640_3

Kemmis, S., & McTaggart, R. (2008). Participatory action research: Communicative action and the public sphere. In N.K. Denzin & Y.S. Lincoln (Eds.), *Strategies of qualitative inquiry* (3rd ed., pp 271-327). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Kenny, J. (2012). Further improvements to the temporary foreign worker program. *Canada's Economic Action Plan*. Retrieved from: http://actionplan.gc.ca/en/news/further-improvements-temporary-foreign-worker

Kivel, P. (2007). Social Service or social change. In Incite! Women of Colour Against Violence (Eds.), *The Revolution will not be funded: Beyond the non-profit industrial complex* (pp. 129-149). Durham: Duke University Press.

Maguire, P. (1987). *Doing participatory research: A feminist approach*. Massachusetts: The Center for International Education School of Education.

Mahrouse, G. (2010). Questioning efforts that seek to "do good"; Insights from transnational solidarity activism and socially responsible tourism. In S. Razack, M.Smith, and S. Thobani (Eds.), *States of race: Critical race feminism for the 21st century* (pp. 169- 190). Toronto: Between the Lines Press.

Mas, S. (2015, January 1). Immigration changes to watch for in 2015. *CBC*. Retrieved from: http://www.cbc.ca/m/news/politics/immigration-changes-to-watch-for-in-2015-1.2828021

Razack, S. (2007). Stealing the pain of others: Reflections on Canadian humanitarian responses. *Review of Education, Pedagogy and Cultural Studies, 29*(4), 375-394. https://doi.org/10.1080/10714410701454198

Rodreiguz, R.M. (2010). *Immigrants for export: How the Philippine state brokers labor to the world*. Minneapolis: University of Minneapolis Press. https://doi.org/10.5749/minnesota/9780816665273.001.0001

Schmitt, R. (1996). Racism and objectification: Reflections on themes from Fanon. In L. Gordon, T. Sharpley-Whiting & R.White (Eds.), *Fanon: A critical reader* (pp.35-50).

Oxford, UK: Blackwell.

Sharma, N. (2011). Canadian multiculturalism and it nationalism. In M. Chazan et al. (Eds), *Home and native land: Unsettling multiculturalism in Canada* (pp.184-192). Toronto: Between the Lines Press.

Shor, I. (1992). *Empowering education: Critical teaching for social change*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Sillito, J. (2012). Edmonton Community Adult Learning Association: Proposal January- June 2013. Edmonton Mennonite Centre for Newcomers.

Smith, A. (2007). Introduction: The Revolution Will Not Be Funded. In In Incite! Women of Colour Against Violence (Eds.) *The Revolution will not be funded: Beyond the non-profit industrial complex* (pp. 1-16). Durham: Duke University Press.

Spivak, G. (1988). 'Can the Subaltern speak?'. In C. Nelson & L. Grossberg, (Eds.). *Marxism and the interpretation of culture.* Basingstroke: Macmillion Education (271-3130). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-349-19059-1_20

Statistics Canada (2005). *Knowledge of official languages among new immigrants: How important is it in the labour market?* Retrieved from http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/89-624-x/2007000/4123782-eng.htm

Thobani, S. (2007). *Exalted subjects: Studies in the making of race and nation in Canada.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Vickers, J., & Isaac (2012). *The politics of race: Canada, the United States and Australia* (2nd ed.). Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Walia, H. (2013). *Undoing Border Imperialism.* Oakland: AK Press.

Wilson, K. (2012). *Race, racism and development: Interrogating history, discourse and practice.* London: Zed.

YEG Newcomers. (2013, October 16). *Edmonton Mennonite Centre for Newcomers-What We Do*[Video File]. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_YSd99XQHYw

Zaman, H. (2006). *Breaking the Iron Wall: Decommodification and Immigrant Women's Labor in Canada.* Michigan: Lexington Books,

Notes

Note 1. The Edmonton Mennonite Centre for Newcomers (EMCN), located in Alberta, Canada, was started 1979 to provide support for Vietnamese 'boat people' and expanded throughout the 1980's, a period in which neoliberal market logics supported the outsourcing of social services for im /migrants to NGOs. In subsequent years, governments at all levels have continued to outsource and download the management of language programs, skill accreditation and/or (re)training, personal counselling, family services, victim supports,

housing and legal aid for im/migrants to service organizations. In recent years a competitive ISO market has developed in the area of settlement support for immigrants who hold permanent residency. At EMCN, the federally sponsored Language Instruction for New Canadians (LINC) program, bridging programs, and employment counseling have significantly expanded. Other programs, while the Parenting and Literacy Program (PLP), accessible regardless of status have become fixed, and the supports offered to Temporary Foreign Workers (TFWs), eliminated.

Note 2. Alberta Learning Information Services is a provincial government website focused on career planning, education and jobs. Immigrants are directed to Government publications such as *Welcome to Alberta: Information for newcomers* and *Working in Alberta: A guide for internationally trained and educated immigrants'* that emphasis the role of immigrant service organisations.

Note 3. Participants in the PLP are asked to sign a waiver at the time of registration, allowing the IS-NGO to use images for promotional purposes. Many participants consciously refuse to sign the waiver for either themselves or their children.

Copyright Disclaimer